

September 16, 2010

Center for Veterinary Medicine (HFV3) Food and Drug Administration 7519 Standish Place Rockville, MD 20855

Division of Dockets Management (HFA-305) 5630 Fishers Lane, Rm 1061 Rockville, MD 20852

RE: **Docket No. FDA-2010-N-0001 and Docket No. FDA-2010-N-0385**, VMAC Meeting on approval of AquAdvantage genetically engineered salmon; Labeling of AquAdvantage genetically engineered salmon

The undersigned members of the food industry, including over 200 chefs, restaurants, grocers, distributors and food companies, urge the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) *not to approve genetically engineered (GE), AquAdvantage salmon for commercial use.*

This transgenic salmon is the first GE animal intended for food, yet the human health impacts of eating these GE fish are completely unknown. These GE fish also pose unacceptable risks to wild salmon and the marine environment. GE salmon must not be approved until and unless further study indicates that it is safe for consumers, native salmon populations, and the environment. Additionally, we are alarmed that the FDA may not require labeling of GE salmon should it be approved. Mandatory labeling is the only way to protect the public's right to know about these unprecedented and material changes to our food.

As food providers, we are the first line of defense for consumers. We are expected to provide the highest quality food possible, and to respond to consumers' desires. *In sum, we advocate sustainable, safe, and nutritious food and therefore have no desire to purchase, sell, or serve GE salmon.*

Greater Use of Antibiotics

Some of our concerns include the potential toxicity, allergenic effects, and diseases posed by the commercialization of transgenic fish. While data on human health impacts of GE fish is sparse, especially because the FDA has yet to share the data it has reviewed, there is cause for serious concern. For example, the routine use of antibiotics to control diseases often found in farm-raised fish can impact human health. Some research suggests that transgenic fish may be susceptible to more diseases than fish currently grown in aquaculture facilities¹. Consequently, the amount of antibiotics given to transgenic fish may be higher than the amount currently given to farmed fish. Already farmed salmon are given more antibiotics by weight than any other livestock. Eating farmed fish treated with antibiotics could be harmful to humans. Indeed, some antibiotics are toxic and can even cause fatal allergic reactions².

Additionally, the use of antibiotics in aquaculture also exacerbates the significant problem of antibiotic resistance in humans (as well as animals). The potential human health concerns connected with the use of antibiotics in aquaculture, including the unique role transgenic fish may play in exacerbating such use, must be fully assessed by the FDA.

Effects on Wild Salmon Population

We are also concerned that GE fish pose serious risks to wild populations of fish, and to consumers who rely on them for healthy nutrition. Each year millions of farmed salmon escape from net pens and outcompete wild populations for resources and straining ecosystems. Even in land-based facilities salmon have the ability to escape and will be virtually impossible to recover. We believe any approval of GE salmon would represent a serious threat to the survival of native salmon populations, many of which have already suffered severe declines related to salmon farms and other man-made impacts.

Escaped GE salmon can pose an additional threat – genetic pollution resulting from what scientists call the "Trojan gene" effect. Research published in the *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* notes that a release of only 60 GE fish into a wild population of 60,000 would lead to the extinction of the wild population in less than 40 fish generations.

Labeling Issue

As already noted, we are greatly concerned that the FDA may not require the labeling of GE salmon if it is approved for the consumer market. It is totally unacceptable for GE fish not to be labeled if approved for commercial use. Our customers tell us that sustainable, safe seafood is of utmost importance to them and in order for us to maintain our professional and personal integrity, it is vital that we have full information on foods that we sell and/or serve. Should the FDA approve GE salmon despite our strong opposition, we unequivocally demand that such fish be labeled.

We know there is a great appetite for salmon, but the solution is not to "farm" GE versions; *the solution is to work to bring our wild salmon populations back.*

 ¹ William Muir et al., <u>Possible ecological risks of transgenic organism release when transgenes affect mating success: Sexual selection and the Trojan gene hypothesis</u>, 96 PNAS 13853-13856, at 13853 (Nov. 23, 1999).
² Rebecca Goldberg and Tracy Triplett. Murky Waters: The Environmental Effects of Aquaculture in the U.S. (p 44). Environmental

² Rebecca Goldberg and Tracy Triplett. Murky Waters: The Environmental Effects of Aquaculture in the U.S. (p 44). Environmental Defense Fund (1997).

We strongly oppose FDA approval of GE salmon. Should FDA decide to approve the AquAdvantage GE salmon despite overwhelming consumer opposition and potential threats to the environment, human health, and native salmon populations, we urge that clear, mandatory labeling be unconditional.

Signed:

Robynn Shrader, CEO **National Cooperative Grocers Association Fishers Choice Wild Salmon and Gifts** Anne Mossness **Eden Foods, Inc** Michael Potter Claudia Reid **California Certified Organic Farmers** Thomas Newmark New Chapter, Inc. Russel Ruderman **Island Naturals Market** Michael Funk **United Natural Foods. Inc.** Kim Davidson **Davidson Commodities, Inc.** Jeff Wright Wright's Nutrients **Heartland Marketing and Sales** Jon Allor Eli **PCC Natural Markets** Penberthy A Taste of the World Laura Anhalt Julia Khodabandeh **Bainbridge Graduate Institute** James Howard CGC Alida Cantor **Chefs Collaborative** Annaliese DeNooyer **Commonplace Coffee** Erin Rice **Contract Foodservice Cultivating Health** Kim Rush Lynch **Edible Seattle** Alex Corcoran Kay Pratt **Fabulous Foods** Sherri Vinton **Farm Friendly LLC** Marsha Weiner **Food Muse Media** Betty Fussell **Fussell's figs** Elizabeth Robinette Lazy R Ranch Susan Hughes Marketing consultant Sue Mcgovern **McGovern Communications**, Helen Brody **New Hampshire Farms Network Cohen-Farnell** Lulu **Real Food for Real Kids** Catherine Mardosa **Red Planet Vegetables** Michelle **Restaurant Associates** Perry Deborah Di Bernardo **Roast House LLC** Judith Kirkhuff **Seattle Farmers Market Association Sustainable Food Educator - Community** Jennifer Hall **Building**, LLC Leah Hadfield The Essential Baking Co.

Food Companies, Grocers, Retailers & Distributors

Catie	Baron	The Essential Baking Company
Anna	Li	The Essential Baking Company
Michael	Sentkewitz	The Essential baking company
Jake	Greenberg	Classic Foods, Ltd
J.	Huston	Farm to Table Food Services
Patricia	Scallan	Guckenheimer
Jason	Sull	Guckenheimer - Operations
David	Joachim	Joachim Ltd Chef Salt
Charlie	Schaffer	Schaffer's Genuine Foods
Patricia	Gadsby	Falmouth farmers' market
James	Nadeau	Hy-Vee
Robert	Young	Whole Foods Markets Artisan Master Butcher
Jennifer	Girvin	Chandler Company
Mary	Doyle	Community Food Co-op
		Food and Thought, owner organic retail
Addison	Fischer	grocer
George	Brereton	Gifts of the Planet Farm
Daniel	Woodham	Goat Lady CSA
Kelii	Kotubetey	Heeia Fishpond
		Restaurant Associates, a division of Compass
Christopher	Fritz	Group
Jody	Crowe	Retail for Local Foods
Sophie	Belanger	Solstice Whole Foods and Herbs
Richard	Belanger	Spirit of Opulence Farm
Christine	Toner	Stonington design+paperie
David	Greenberg	Success by design
Catherine	Wissner	Wild Winds Sheep Company
David	Warner	City Feed and Supply
Peter	de Garmo	Pastaworks

Chefs and Restaurants

Janis	McLean	15ria
Mike	Whitesides	Affairs To Remember
Matthew	Coyle	Alpine Grove
Carrie	Balkcom	American Grassfed Association
Bryan	Grund	ARAMARK
Barbara	Barton	Argus
Daryl	Burchfield	ARK Community Charter School
Judith	Klinger	Aroma Cucina
Victoria	LaPlante	Babe's Beanery
Amy	Bodiker	Bodiker Consulting, LLC
Michael	Delcambre	Bon Appetit Management Company
Kyle	McCleary	Bon Appetit Management Company @
		Macalester College

Liana Lina	Robberecht Romasanta	Calgary Petroleum Club California Culinary Academy Le
Lina		Cordon Bleu
Alison	Costello	Capuchin Soup Kitchen
Richard	Grausman	Careers through Culinary Arts Program
Christopher	Harley	Cascadian Square LLC
Stephen	Sheer	CHEFFLEX
Jennifer	Ede	Chefs Collaborative
Tselani	Richmond	Chez Tse
Pascal	Dionot	Classic Cooking Academy
Paul	D'Avino	Cochon Restaurant, Brigtsen's
		Restaurant (both New Orleans, LA),
		New England Culinary Institute
Tom	Cohen	(Montpelier, VT)
		Culinary Revolution Catering
Bernardo	Coelho	Compass Group
Keith	Fournier	Compass Group
Robert	Willis	Consulting chef
Julia	dellaCroce	Consulting chef
Kris	Jakob	Culinary Institute LeNôtre
Susan	Ciriello	Culinary Instructor/Art Institute of
		Washington
Christa	Glennie Seychew	Currently working as a food editor
Erika	Zetty	Custom Cuisine by Erika LLC
Roland	Henin	Delaware North Companies
Sharon	Worster	EZChef.net
Jake	Francis	Farm 255
Jennifer	Armentrout	Fine Cooking Magazine
Douglas	Katz	Fire Food & Drink
Michell	Bretall	Fire & Knives Organic Caterer &
_		Personal Chef
Don	Splain	Fischer int.
Sarah	Splain	Food and Thought
Barbara Ann	McMonigal	Food Family Farming Foundation
Thomas James	Robinson	Food service technician at St. Clair
D 1		County Community Health Authority
Patrick	Havard	Four Seasons Hotel Company
Charis	Rose	Goat Lady Dairy Dinners
Peter	Marrello	Great Performances/ Sotheby's
David	Drapes	Guckenheimer
Jeremy	Mayer	Guckenheimer
Amanda	Moore	Guckenheimer
Shane	Neal	Guckenheimer Enterprises INC.
Jennifer	Hancox	Hancox Restaurant Training
Esther	Bernstein	Heavenly Rest Stop Oui Cater Inc.
Ilene	ross	Hot Food! Catering

Donal	O' Rourke	Hudson Grille
Brandon	Thomas	Lumiere Restaurant in West Newton,
		MA
john	stanley	Illinois Institute of Art - Chicago
0	•	Culinary Department
Janet	Reynolds	IMAGINATION
Caroline	Lewis	In Good Taste cooking school, Portland,
		OR
Erin	Coopey	In Good Taste Pairings
Renee	Marton	Institute of Culinary Education Chef
		Instructor/ Food Writer
April	Powell	InviteAvitE
Rob	Mayerat	Irish Times
Christopher	Agnew	Islandwood:A school in the woods
Allen	Edwards	Ivy Tech Community College,
~ .	~	Indianapolis, IN
Charlotte	Song	Joli Kobe Bakery & Cafe
Nicole	Stemler	Julius Meinl
Clinton	Moorehead	Lake Limerick Country Club
Vicki	Hyndman	Le Cordon Bleu College of Culinary
T	Cana	Arts
Jeremiah	Cone	Le Cordon Bleu College of Culinary
Emily	Moore	Arts Los Angeles Le Cordon Bleu College of Culinary
Emily	WIOOTE	Arts, Seattle WA
Wendy	Roskin	Le Cordon Bleu College of Culinary
wendy	KOSKIII	Arts-LA
Amanda	Levine	le Cordon Bleu student
Ian	Troxler	Lone Mountain Ranch
Bryan	Szeliga	Lucy's Table
Michael	Leviton	Lumiere
Virginia	Thiell	Marcum Conference Center
Lauren	McCabe	MealThymes
Catherine	Lucas	Mere Catherine Cuisine
Richard	Hetzler	Mitsitam Native Foods Cafe/ Restaurant
		Associates
Laura	Lee	Napa Valley Cooking School Chef
		Instructor
Robin	Asbell	Natural Food Chef
Nicole	Aloni	Nicole Aloni
Robert	Parks	oci
Sharon	Montoya-Welsh	Oyster Cookery
Vitaly	Paley	Paley's Place Bistro and Bar
Paul	Psathas	Personal Chef
Christopher	Wegwart	Personal Chef
Phoebe	Cole-Smith	PICNIC

Carrie	Christensen	Private Chef
Traca	Savadogo	Private chef.
Ivan	Kyutukchiev	Raymonds restaurant, St.John's
Justin	Dean	Relish Restaurant Group: The Bistro,
Justin	Dean	Local 127, Lavomatic, Chalk
		Food+Wine,
		Greenup Cafe, Grammers. Cincinnati
		Ohio/Northern KY
Bruce	Barnes	Restaurant Associates
Michael	Dekker	Rouge Restaurant Calgary, Alberta
Elizabeth	Howes	Saffron Lane
Kathleen	de Chadenedes	s'Cool Food Initiative
Kathy	Bilodeau	self employed on call chef
Timothy	Duque	Starwood Hotels
Jamey	Tochtrop	Stellina Pasta Cafe
Gary	Caron	Stripers Waterside Restaurant
5		Kennebunkport, ME
John	Foster	Sullivan University
Susan	Lane	Susan A. Lane Events and Catering Co.
Suzanne	Scalfaro	Suzanne Scalfaro, Chef LLC
John	DiLeo	Tanuki Tavern
Jeff	Rossman	Terra Restaurant & Catering
Judith	Basso	The Bull Run Restaurant Shirley, MA
Joanne	Dyck	the Learning Kitchen
Amy	Cotler	The Locavore Way
Gigia	Kolouch	The Natural Pantry
Joe	George	The Twentieth Century Club
David	Hackett	The Westin Diplomat Golf Resort and
		Spa
Andrew	Porte	The Westin Tabor Center Hotel
Maria	Hines	Tilth
Richard	Reiter	Toppers/Kingson NY (now closed)
Michael	Miller	Toques
Twillia	Glover	Twillia Glover Catering
Susan	OKeefe	University food service
Rick	White	Whole Foods Market
Andrew	Laughlin	Zocca
Natalie	Sellers	4th St Bistro, Reno, NV
Christy	Perez	Alaska Marine highway Ferry
Deborah	Scarborough	Black Cat Bistro
Casey	Morell	CafeZorro
David	Drew	Cambridge Brewing Company
David Soth	Pow	Chef Geoff's
Seth Rick	Caswell	emmer&rye Frontoro Crill Topolohompo & XOCO
	Bayless	Frontera Grill, Topolobampo & XOCO Guckenheimer
Tim	Olmstead	Guckennenner

Brian	Keefe	Guckenheimer Enterprises, Inc.
Lucia	Watson	Lucia's Restaurant, chef owner Lucia
Luciu		Watson
Brian	Hutchins	Luna Restaurant and Bouzies bakery
Nancy	Lazarus	Moosewood Restaurant
Lisa	Schroeder	Mother's Bistro & Bar Mama Mia
		Trattoria
Bruce	Sherman	North Pond Restaurant, Chicago
Michael	Ainslie	Pitfire Artisan Pizza
Kim	Muller	Real Food Nation
Jose	Diaz	Restaurant Associates
Paul	Rogalski	Rouge Restaurant
Peter	Hoffman	Savoy restaurant, Back Forty
		Restaurant
Holly	Smith	Somerset Ventures dba Cafe Juanita
		and Poco Carretto Gelato
Mary	Cleaver	The Cleaver Co The Green Table
Michael	Hirst	Willow Ridge Golf Club Iowa Central
	_	Community College
Тоу	Dupree	Amy's Bread - 3 retail bakery cafe's in
	~ .	Manhattan.
Micah	Cavolo	Bon Appetit Managment Company
Craig	Sewell	A Cook's Cafe, Annapolis, Maryland
Michelle	LeBleu	FM 2711
Diane	LaVonne	Diane's Market Kitchen
Jess	Kriss	Blackstone Caterers
Jennifer	McCombie	Bon Appetite Catering
Joel	Blice	Chauncey Conference Center
Jo Christins	Kumery	Guckenheimer
Christina	Curtin	Guckenheimer Enterprises
Lowin	Stain	Incorporated, Flix Cafe
Lorin	Stein Webster	Guckenheimer Studio Plaza Cafe
Donna Kostantinos		Guckenheimer, LIberty Cafe Local roots restaurant Roanoke VA
Diane	Kontogiannis Elliot	Local Roots: A Farm to Table
Dialle	Emot	Restaurant, Roanoke, VA
Melina	Packer	M&She
Jessica	Blaine	Marche, LLC
Fritzi	Cohen	Moby Dick Hotel and Oysterfarm, and
1 11121	Conen	Hotel Tabard Inn.
Patti	Miller	Panorama at the Peak - Dining with a
		View
Cynthia	Walter	Passionfish (Owner)
Jeffrey	Holland	Sheraton Denver downtown hotel
Robert	Wolosin	The Turtle, Brownwood, TX Bar
		Manager
		0

Helen Cameron

Uncommon Ground (2 restaurants in Chicago)

* Some companies or restaurants may be listed for identification purposes only